



# Testing Behavioural Insights at the municipal level

Tobin Postma  
September 21, 2018

- Understanding human behavior is critical for improving public services
- By paying attention to how people actually behave in practice, city officials can identify, understand, and design more effective programs and policies
- Advances in technology mean that city administrations can play a more deliberate role in accelerating and nurturing innovation

- Launched three trials in twelve months:
  1. Business Licence renewals
  2. Alarm Permit renewals
  3. Dog Licence renewals
- A fourth trial (Parking fine payments) is awaiting approval

- **Aim:** Increase on-time business licence renewals
- **Intervention:** Changing the renewal notice
- **EAST elements:** EASY, ATTRACTIVE, SOCIAL – the notice was made more action focused with a salient deadline, the option to pay online made salient and gain-framed, a social norms message was included (*the majority of businesses in Vancouver pay online*) and the losses associated with not renewing on time (*i.e. late penalty fee*) were moved higher in the notice
- **Stage:** Finished - the results indicate that the proportion of businesses renewing their licences on time was significantly higher with the behaviourally informed notice compared to the standard notice with renewals rates being 70.9% and 67.5%, respectively. However, the issues associated with randomization mean that we do not know whether this effect is due to the intervention or the biases associated with randomization and as such we can draw no firm conclusions

# Business Licences

## Control Group



### 2017 Business Licence Renewal Notice

Account number: !



1521071

Payment must be received by December 31, 2016. Ensure that the information listed below is current. For changes, see opposite side for instructions.

Licence Type	Locations	Overdue Fee(s)	2017 Fee	Vending Machine	ATM/Bank Machine	Total(s)
Retail Dealer - Food		0	258	0	56	314
Retail Dealer - Food		0	258	0	56	314
Retail Dealer - Food		0	258	0	56	314
						<b>Due \$942</b>

Pay online at [vancouver.ca/businesslicence](http://vancouver.ca/businesslicence)

Pay by phone Telephone: 3-1-1; outside Vancouver: 604.873.7000. 7am-10pm, 7 days per week.

Operating a business without a valid licence is a violation of License By-Law No. 4450 and is subject to legal action. A late penalty of \$40 or 10% of the licence fee, whichever is greater, will be applied to each licence.

Note: If you are no longer in business, notify us via email at [licenceoffice@vancouver.ca](mailto:licenceoffice@vancouver.ca). The following information must be included in your request: licence number(s), business name, business owner name and business address.

Return this stub with your payment only if paying by mail.

Payment must be received by December 31, 2016



### 2017 Business Licence Renewal Notice

Account number: !



1521071

Community Services, Licence Office  
PO Box 7878 Vancouver, BC, V6B 4E2

Licence Type	Locations	Overdue Fee(s)	2017 Fee	Vending Machine	ATM/Bank Machine	Total(s)
Retail Dealer - Food		0	258	0	56	314
Retail Dealer - Food		0	258	0	56	314
Retail Dealer - Food		0	258	0	56	314
						<b>Due \$942</b>

## Treatment Group



### 2018 Business Licence Renewal Notice

Account number: !



1096597

Social norms msg + gains of online payment

Clear call to action with salient deadline

Your business licence needs to be renewed by December 31, 2017. The majority of businesses in Vancouver pay online. This is the simplest and quickest way to renew your licence. If you do not pay by December 31st you will be charged a late penalty fee of \$40 or 10% of your licence fee greater.

To pay now, visit: [vancouver.ca/pay-business-licence](http://vancouver.ca/pay-business-licence)

Losses moved higher

Online payment made salient

Licence Type	Locations	Overdue Fee(s)	2018 Fee	Vending Machine	ATM/Bank Machine	Total(s)
Apartment House		0	2911	0	0	2911
Apartment House		0	3621	0	0	3621
Apartment House		0	4402	0	0	4402
						<b>Due \$10934</b>

For changes, see opposite side for instructions.

Note: If you are no longer in business, notify us via email at [licenceoffice@vancouver.ca](mailto:licenceoffice@vancouver.ca). The following information must be included in your request: licence number(s), business name, business owner name and business address.

Return this stub with your payment only if paying by mail.

Payment must be received by December 31, 2017



### 2018 Business Licence Renewal Notice

Account number: !



1096597

Licence Office  
PO Box 7878 Vancouver, BC, V6B 4E2

Licence Type	Locations	Overdue Fee(s)	2018 Fee	Vending Machine	ATM/Bank Machine	Total(s)
Apartment House		0	2911	0	0	2911
Apartment House		0	3621	0	0	3621
Apartment House		0	4402	0	0	4402
						<b>Due \$10934</b>

- **Aim:** Increase on-time and online alarm permit renewals
- **Intervention:** Changing the renewal notice
- **EAST elements:** EASY, ATTRACTIVE, SOCIAL - the notice has been made more action focused, the option to pay online has been made more salient and gain-framed and a social norms message has been included. It also includes a red 'renew now' stamp
- **Stage:** Finished - the results indicate that the proportion of permit holders renewing their permits on time was significantly higher with the behaviourally informed notice compared to the standard notice with renewals rates being 58.4% and 55.2% respectively



# Alarm permits

## Control Group

**CITY OF VANCOUVER**

**2018 Alarm Permit Renewal Notice**  
Permit number:  
Account number:

Permit Type	Alarm Type	Location	Overdue Fee(s)	2018 Fee	Reinstatement Fee
Residential	Audible (makes sound)		0.00	17.55	0.00
PAYMENT DUE January 15, 2018				Total Due	\$17.55

**Pay Online** at [vancouver.ca/alarmpermit](http://vancouver.ca/alarmpermit) and update your information if needed.

Pay in person 453 West 12th Avenue (Vancouver City Hall) 1st floor Revenue Services Department  
If after hours you can deposit your form and payment in the mail slot at City Hall 12th Ave entrance.

Pay by mail Alarm Permit, PO Box 7878 Vancouver, BC V6B 4E2  
Make cheques payable to: City of Vancouver (Note your permit number on the cheque.) Credit card cheques are not accepted.

Note: If you have disconnected your alarm system or have moved, please contact the City of Vancouver at 604.717.3277.

**2018 Alarm Permit Renewal Notice**  
Permit number: Account number: 1  
Janette Lim

Permit Type	Alarm Type	Location	Overdue Fee(s)	2018 Fee	Reinstatement F
Residential	Audible (makes sound)		0.00	17.55	0.
PAYMENT DUE January 15, 2018				Total Due	\$17.55

As a value-added benefit to you, please consider the option of providing your email address so that we may help reduce waste and serve you more efficiently. Email address : \_\_\_\_\_

\*\*\*Please indicate any necessary changes below and return with your payment.\*\*\*

Alarm Company: Safelink Communications	Monitoring Company: Safelink Communications
--	---

By law, you must provide the Vancouver Police Department and the monitoring company with current and accurate keyholder or guard service information. Three (3) Keyholder References or one (1) Guard Service must be listed. If the names or contact numbers have changed, you must update the list below.

Name: Lim, Francis	Cell: 604.250.8001	Home: 604.263.4805	Work: 604.263.5576
Name: Cardoso, Elizabeth	Cell:	Home: 604.263.4805	Work:
Name: Lim, Robert	Cell:	Home: 604.263.8024	Work:

Page 1 of 1

Online payment made salient and link to start of process

## Treatment Group

**CITY OF VANCOUVER**

**2017 Alarm Permit Renewal Notice**  
Permit number: 1  
Account number:

**RENEW NOW**

Your Alarm Permit must be renewed by December 8, 2017. Please pay \$17.55 via one of the payment methods below. The majority of permit holders in Vancouver pay online. This is the simplest and quickest way.

**To pay now visit: [vancouver.ca/pay-alarm-permit](http://vancouver.ca/pay-alarm-permit)**

Other payment methods include:  
By mail: Alarm Permit, PO Box 7878 Vancouver, BC V6B 4E2. Cheques payable to: City of Vancouver (Note your number on the cheque and attach the stub below). Credit card cheques are not accepted.  
In person: 453 West 12th Avenue (Vancouver City Hall) 1st floor Revenue Services Department

**2017 Alarm Permit Renewal Notice**  
Permit number: 1885543 Account number: 581418  
Tom Kusumoto

Permit Type	Alarm Type	Location	Overdue Fee(s)	2017 Fee	Reinstatement Fee
Residential	Audible (makes sound)		0.00	17.55	0.00
PAYMENT DUE December 8, 2017				Total Due	\$17.55

To reduce waste and receive notices via email, please provide your email address : \_\_\_\_\_

\*\*\*Please indicate any necessary changes below and return with your payment.\*\*\*

Alarm Company:	Monitoring Company: Alarm Max Security Incorporated
----------------	---

By law, you must provide the Vancouver Police Department and the monitoring company with current and accurate keyholder or guard service information. If the names or contact numbers have changed, you must update the list below.

Name:	Cell:	Home: 1	Work:
Name:	Cell:	Home:	Work:
Name:	Cell:	Home:	Work:

Page 1 of 1

Social norms msg + gains of online payment

Red stamp

Clear call to action + salient deadline

Simplified messaging

- **Aim:** Increase on-time and online dog licence renewals
- **EAST elements:** EASY, ATTRACTIVE, SOCIAL - the adapted notice includes a grain framed message (return of lost dogs and fund public services), a red 'renew now' stamp, more action focused, make the payment options salient and highlight the losses associated with late payment
- **Intervention:** Changing the renewal notice
- **Stage:** Launched



# Dog Licences

## Control Group



### Dog Licence Renewal Notice Account number:

City of Vancouver Animal Services  
1280 Raymur Avenue, Vancouver, BC V6A 3L8  
Within Vancouver, telephone: 3-1-1  
Outside Vancouver, telephone: 604-873-7000

A late penalty of \$10 will be applied to each licence that is one month past due.

Dog Name	Tag	Due Date	Amount
Abby		02 Feb 2018	43.00
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>\$43</b>

**Pay online** at [vancouver.ca/PetRenewal](http://vancouver.ca/PetRenewal) or on the VanConnect app- downloadable from iTunes.

**Pay by phone** In Vancouver: 3-1-1 Outside Vancouver: 604-873-7000

**Pay in person** Vancouver City Hall, 453 West 12th Avenue, 1st Floor Revenue Services Department, 8:30 am - 5 pm Monday to Friday. Vancouver Animal Services, 1280 Raymur Avenue, 10 am - 6 pm, 7 days a week.

For further useful information regarding your dog, please visit our animal services website at [vancouver.ca/pets](http://vancouver.ca/pets)

All dogs over the age of three (3) months in the City of Vancouver must have and be wearing a current dog licence.  
Benefits of a dog licence: - Licensing allows the shelter to care for lost dogs and provides pet adoptions services.  
- Lost dogs have a 97% return rate to owners if licenced and receive a "free ride home" once a year, no questions!  
- Licensing helps provide important statistics to manage the need for dog facilities and services in the city (off-leash dog parks).  
- Licensing puts your dog on the Emergency Pet Registry and shows you are a responsible dog owner.

Please submit this portion with your payment

### Dog Licence Renewal Notice Account number:

Sign up for email renewal!

(Email address)

Dog Name	Tag	Due Date	Amount
Abby		02 Feb 2018	43.00
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>\$43</b>

## Treatment Group



### Dog Licence Renewal Notice Account number:

City of Vancouver Animal Services  
1280 Raymur Avenue, Vancouver, BC V6A 3L8

Red renew stamp

More salient msg  
and action focused

**RENEW NOW**

To Bob Dole:

It is a legal requirement for all dogs over the age of three months in the City of Vancouver to have a dog licence. Your dog's licence is due to expire on May 23, 2018. Please renew via one of these payment methods. The amount due is in the table below.

**Pay online: Vancouver.ca/PetRenewal**

**Pay by phone: 3-1-1 or 604-873-7000**

**Pay in person: Vancouver Animal Services, 1280 Raymur Ave  
OR Vancouver City Hall, 453 W 12th Ave,  
1st floor Revenue Services.**

Gain framed  
msg

Imagine your dog was lost - how would they find their way home?

Lost dogs who are licenced have a 97% return rate to their owners.

Licences also help to fund dog services in Vancouver such as off leash parks.



**Renew your licence today!**

A late penalty fee will be charged if you fail to pay on time. All unlicenced dogs are also subject to a \$250 fine.

If you no longer have a dog, notify us by calling 3-1-1 or 604.873.7000.

Losses associated  
with late payment

Please submit this portion with your payment

### Dog Licence Renewal Notice Account number: 581516

Sign up for email renewal!

(Email address)

Dog Name	Tag	Due Date	Amount
petty2		23 May 2018	42.00
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>\$42.00</b>

- **Aim:** Increase parking fine payments and online payments
- **Intervention:** Changing the reminder notice
- **EAST elements:** EASY, ATTRACTIVE, SOCIAL - notice will include a red 'pay now' stamp, be personalized, have a clear call to action and deadline, include a social norms message about paying online, and the losses associated with not paying will be made salient
- **Stage:** Awaiting approval for launch

## Control Group

### BY-LAW NOTICE - REMINDER

Notice number: AA00000

Statement Date: << date reminder batch is run >>

### BARCODE

Property Address:  
Folio:  
Office Date:  
By-law:  
Section:  
Section Description:

Payment received as of <<statement date>>: \$ 0  
Amount due on or before <<21 day date>>: \$ 0  
Amount due after <<21 day date>>: \$ 0

Our records show this By-law Notice has not been paid in full nor has a Dispute Request been filed. The amount shown above is now due and payable.

If you have already made a payment on this By-law Notice, it may not have been received within the discount period. Therefore the amount shown is still owing to the City.

You may view your ticket balance online at [vancouver.ca](http://vancouver.ca) or call 3-1-1 for assistance.

Please remit your payment by <<21 day date>> to avoid an additional surcharge.

See reverse for payment instructions.

### BY-LAW NOTICE - REMINDER

Notice number: AA00000

### BARCODE

VANBLN

Registered owner  
Address Line 1  
Address Line 2  
Address Line 3  
Address Line 4  
Address Line 5

Payment received as of <<date reminder batch is run>>: \$ 0  
Amount due on or before <<21 day date>>: \$ 0  
Amount due after <<21 day date>>: \$ 0

AA000009 00000050009 00000100009 00000150009

## Treatment Group

Notice number: AA00000

Statement Date: << date reminder batch is run >>

### BARCODE

Property Address:  
Folio:  
Office Date:  
By-law:  
Section:  
Section Description:

Payment received as of <<statement date>>: \$ 0  
Amount due on or before <<21 day date>>: \$ 0  
Amount due after <<21 day date>>: \$ 0

**PAY NOW**

To [Insert Name],

You are late paying your parking fine for your [insert make of car]. You are in the minority of people who have not yet paid.

Nine out of ten people pay their parking fines online. Please pay [Amount] by [Date] via one of the payment methods below.



Visit [vancouver.ca/parking-ticket](http://vancouver.ca/parking-ticket)



Call 3-1-1

If you do not pay by [date] an additional 50% will be added to the amount due, making the total amount [\$]. Your [insert make of car] may also be towed for future offenses.

If you have already made a payment it has not been received within the discount period. Therefore the amount shown is still due.

- Find the right people
- Look for inspiration
- Practice patience
- Discovering barriers to experimentation
- Navigating the move from simple to complex